A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship

Muhammad Mustain¹, Margo Purnomo², Tetty Herawaty³
¹,²,³Faculty of Social and Political Science, Padjajaran University, Bandung

ABSTRACT: Ethnic entrepreneurship involves business practices run by specific ethnic groups, with a focus on utilizing economic resources and enterprise development to maintain and develop their cultural heritage. The main purpose of this article is to direct researchers in creating a theoretical framework and guide researchers who are new to ethnic entrepreneurship research so that they know which journals and authors to consult when studying this phenomenon. To do so, this study used the Scopus database to determine the research areas with the most research results, the countries that conduct the most ethnic entrepreneurship research, the most authors who write about ethnic entrepreneurship, the journals that publish the most research and the most cited documents.

KEYWORDS: Ethnic Group, Entrepreneurship, Ethnic Entrepreneurship, Scopus

I. INTRODUCTION
In recent decades, especially in metropolitan cities around the world, there has been massive migration from different socio-cultural or ethnic origins (Dana, 2007; Dana & Morris, 2011, 2007; Levent et al., 2003; Wong 1998; Waldinger et al., 2006; DeHart, 2010). This growth forms a new dynamic in society, where ethnic groups become important entities. An ethnic group is a group of people who are considered to have similar ethnic backgrounds. They are in a common cause where origin and culture play a major role in shaping group identity. This means that not only hereditary or geographical aspects, but also inherited values and traditions become important elements that unite individuals in these ethnic groups.

(Simpson & Yinger, 2013). In recent years, the interest and orientation of ethnic groups has seen a significant increase, especially in the context of entrepreneurship. This phenomenon is known as ethnic entrepreneurship, a concept that describes the process by which individuals who are not members of the majority population in a region actively identify market opportunities, undertake innovative activities, and take risks for the sake of prosperity for themselves, their families, and society as a whole. Ethnic entrepreneurship marks a paradigm shift in entrepreneurship studies, highlighting the significant contributions of ethnic groups to economic and social dynamics amidst cultural diversity and inherited values (Vaaler, 2011).

According to (Rahim & Mohtar, 2015) entrepreneurial behavior can be influenced by external factors such as the role of the community in the socio-cultural environment. Research from (Cai et al., 2018) also mentions the role of community as an external factor that can influence entrepreneurial behavior. Furthermore (Hayton & Cacciotti, 2013) also confirms the previous statement with research results that prove the existence of differences in entrepreneurial culture that have an impact on entrepreneurial behavior caused by the socio-cultural and ethnic background of individuals or groups of business actors. The definition according to (Aldrich & Waldinger, 1990) ethnic entrepreneurship is a group of people bound to the same cultural heritage or origin who run a business either as owners or operators.

The study of ethnic entrepreneurship in emerging markets is important because ethnic entrepreneurs contribute to the economic growth of the countries in which they live (Johnson et al., 2007). This importance is underscored by the rise of ethnic entrepreneurship studies focusing on emerging markets (Lin, 2010; Nkongolo-Bakenda and Chrysostome, 2013; Riddle and Brinkerhoff, 2011; Vaaler, 2011). For example, in Indonesia, how ethnic entrepreneurship has evolved over time by facing various threats in the form of challenges to take advantage of opportunities in starting and developing their business in a new environment (Jonius, 2011). Examples of the success of ethnic groups in Indonesia in practicing the principles of entrepreneurship include culinary, handicraft, and trade businesses owned and run by certain ethnic groups. For example, culinary businesses such as restaurants or food stalls typical of Chinese, Minangkabau, or Tegal (Java) ethnicities have become an integral part of the culinary industry in Indonesia. There are also successful ethnic entrepreneurs in the field of handicrafts, such as batik, weaving, and wood
A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship

carving, which demonstrate Indonesia’s cultural heritage. These field facts demonstrate the significant contribution of ethnic entrepreneurship to Indonesia’s economy and cultural diversity (Ilhan Nas, Sahin, & Cilingir, 2011).

Van Delft, H., Gorter, C., & Nijkamp, P., (2000) Culture and ethnicity are important elements (Ibrahim & Galt, 2011). Where cultural factors can influence entrepreneurial motivation through cultural identity, values and traditions passed down from generation to generation. Meanwhile, ethnic factors dominate in ethnic entrepreneurship due to the strong linkages between ethnic identity, social networks, and access to resources in starting and developing businesses. Support systems and networks within ethnic groups have characteristics that enable ethnic entrepreneurs to create and develop business initiatives through member linkages, informal social structures, reliability, and interdependence, which provide access to financial capital, information, knowledge, family or co-ethnic labor, investors, and other entrepreneurs to share resources from home and destination countries (Urban & Ratsimanetrimanana, 2015).

Therefore, the purpose of this study is to conduct a systematic literature review on ethnic entrepreneurship studies. Conducting this research is considered important to provide relevant recommendations for practitioners and academics for the future development of ethnic entrepreneurship studies. To do so, this study utilized the Scopus database to determine the research areas with the largest research output, the countries with the most ethnic entrepreneurship research, the most categories that discuss ethnic entrepreneurship, the journals that published the most research and the most cited documents.

II. METHODOLOGY

This research aims to provide a mapping picture of the development of ethnic entrepreneurship that can later generate further background and in-depth insights. In addition, the mapping results can also develop the concept of ethnic entrepreneurship on topics that have not been researched before. Academic literature has proposed various approaches to examine the influence of certain variables, among them bibliometrics (Das, 2015). Bibliometric data analysis helps researchers to comprehensively analyze variables from various perspectives and understand their development (Fallinholfer, 2019). Therefore, this study uses bibliometric analysis to investigate the importance of the development of ethnic entrepreneurship academic research.

A. Database Selection

This study chose Scopus as the database used in collecting data. Scopus was chosen for several reasons, including the high popularity of using Scopus for bibliometric research, because Scopus has several advantages. First, the coverage of fields in Scopus is broader than Web of Science (WoS) (Zhu & Liu, 2020) and is more frequently cited by researchers and academics (Martin-Martin et al., 2021). Second, Scopus generates more citations than WoS despite having a shorter time frame (Pranckute, 2021). Third, Scopus is the most extensive abstract and citation database provider launched by Elsevier in 2004 (Burnham, 2006; Guz & Rushchitsky, 2009).

B. Data Collection

The data collection stage in early research is divided into two. First, the process of identifying scientific articles that will be processed as research data. This identification was done through database searches with several keywords, namely "ethnic entrepre* OR ethnic busines* OR ethnic enter*". Second, the data selection stage, which is the stage of further data filtering process with restrictions on certain categories. This includes restrictions on document type and language. For a more detailed look at the data collection stage, which can be seen in Figure 1.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Annual Research Publication Trends

The initial presentation of the results of this study is to examine the annual trend of 433 ethnic entrepreneurship publications. The search, which has been limited to the last two decades, has become increasingly attractive to researchers and academics, with 10 publications in 2002 and 30 publications in 2022. This evolution has become more significant over the last decade, with the average annual publication consistently exceeding 10 documents, and in 2019 reaching the highest annual publication volume of 35 documents. These results show the high interest of researchers to explore the emerging themes that fall within the field of ethnic entrepreneurship, where research still has a long way to go.
Figure 2. Annual Publication Trends over two decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship research

Based on the results of Scopus data analysis of 433 Ethnic Entrepreneurship publications, showing 10 categories of research fields that are the subject, the top five categories in the number of publications are shown in table 1. The highest category of research fields in the number of publications is social sciences (254 documents; 37% of the total publications). Next in the second order category is the field of business, management and accounting (182 documents; 26.5% of the total publications). Meanwhile, the third order category is economics, econometrics, and finance (116 documents; 16.9% of the total publications). The fourth and fifth categories are arts and humanities (61 documents; 8.9% of total publications) and environmental science (21 documents; 3.1% of total publications). The top five EE publication fields account for 92.4% of the total 433 publications, which means that ethnic entrepreneurship publications dominate globally.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Research Field</th>
<th>Total Documents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Business, Management And Accounting</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Economics, Econometrics, And Finance</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Arts And Humanities</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Environmental Science</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Documents by country from the Ethnic Entrepreneurship Study

Information in (Figure 2) can be seen that the country that contributes the most to the publication of ethnic entrepreneurship studies is the United States with 118 documents, then there is the UK with 84 documents, Canada with 33 documents, Australia with 29 documents, Germany and the Netherlands with 21, Malaysia with 18, Italy with 16, China with 15, and New Zealand with 13.

Figure 3. Country of Origin of Ethnic Entrepreneurship Publications
A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship

C. Documents by Author of Ethnic Entrepreneurship Study

The information in the figure can be explained that the ten authors with the most publications in the field of Ethnic Entrepreneurship studies are Nijkamp, P with 10 documents, then Boyd, Brenner, Menzies, and Wang with 6 documents each, Masurel & Ojo with 5 documents, Altinay, Bent, and Dana with 4 documents each.

D. Documents by College Affiliation Ethnic entrepreneurship studies

The ten most productive publication affiliations in ethnic entrepreneurship studies are Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam with 12 documents, then The University of North Carolina and Universiti Malaya with 8 documents each, University Of Toronto with 7 documents, Massissippi State University, Oxford Brookes University, Auckland University and Toronto Metropolitan University have the same number of publications with 6 documents, finally HEC Montreal and Radboud Universiteit with 5 documents.

E. Most Cited Documents

Table 2: Most Cited Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Number of Citations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Motivations and performance conditions for ethnic entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Masurel, Enno, Tastan, Murat Vindigni, &amp; Gabriella (2002)</td>
<td>Growth and Change</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policies to support ethnic minority enterprise: The English experience</td>
<td>Ram, Monder &amp; Smallbone, David (2003)</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship and Regional Development</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
E. Data Processed by Researchers

Then the researcher processed the data using VOSviewer software to provide an overview of the results of the bibliometric mapping analysis of research topic trends grouped into 7 clusters with 122 items. Topics included in cluster 1 (25 items) are entrepreneur, ethnic encalves, ethnic entrepreneurship, ethnicity, firm ownership, gender, gender role, minority group, minority etc. Cluster 2 (21 items) consists of consumption behavior, culture, economics, ethnic businesses, ethnic entrepreneurs, ethnic identity, ethnic minorities, identity, innovation etc. Cluster 3 (19 items) consists of African immigrant, business, economic development, ethnic business, ethnic enterprise, ethnic group, family business, integration, migrants etc. Cluster 4 (18 items) consists of Asian immigrant, employment, entrepreneurship, ethnic economy, ethnic enclave, immigrant entrepreneurship, immigrant population etc. Cluster 5 (15 items) consists of business development, business performance, conceptual framework, diaspora, ethnic entrepreneur, immigrant entrepreneur, industrial performance, multinational enterprise, networks, transnational entrepreneurship etc. Cluster 6 (15 items) consists of cultural identity, eastern hemisphere, economic activity, historical perspective, social network, southeast asia, transnationalism etc. Cluster 7 (9 items) consists of entrepreneurial orientation, entrepreneurialism, entrepreneurs, ethnic groups, ethnography, turkey, Germany etc.

![Network Visualization Map of Ethnic Entrepreneurship](image)

**Figure 5. Network Visualization Map of Ethnic Entrepreneurship**

*Source: Data Processing in VOSviewer*

The figure shows the mapping results regarding the publication trends of topics covered in ethnic entrepreneurship based on the year of publication. It was found that some contemporary topics were published since 2016, which are colored yellow such as ethnic enclave, immigrant entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial orientation, international migrant, social capital, ethnography, family business.

![Overlay Visualization Map of Ethnic Entrepreneurship](image)

**Figure 6. Overlay Visualization Map of Ethnic Entrepreneurship**

*Source: Data processing in VOSviewer*

Furthermore, in Figure 7 there are the results of density visualization mapping from the ethnic entrepreneurship study. It can be seen that the colors that appear are from darker ones such as blue, then green, and the lighter ones are yellow. The lighter the color that appears, the denser or more research on the topic has been done. So it can be seen that the research topics that
A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship

are still little discussed include multinational enterprises, migrant workers, ethnic economy, migrant experience, multiculturalism, ethnic minorities, entrepreneurial orientation, ethnic business, business performance and historical perspective.

Figure 7. Density Visualization Map of Ethnic Entrepreneurship
Source: Data processing on VOSviewer

IV. CONCLUSIONS

The most commonly used definition to define ethnic entrepreneurship is the one adopted by Aldrich and Waldinger (1990): "a group of people bound to a common cultural heritage or origin who operate a business as owners or operators". Meanwhile, based on several research papers, ethnic entrepreneurship is generally defined as value-creating business activities undertaken by a group whose members share a common cultural heritage or origin and are recognized by people who do not belong to the group as possessing such attributes (Aldrich and Waldinger, 1990; Drori et al., 2009).

The research trend on Ethnic Entrepreneurship studies began in 1987. For two decades, it has been an interesting topic of discussion for researchers and academics characterized by the growth of research on this study until it reached the highest publication in 2019 with 35 documents. From a total of 433 documents analyzed from Scopus database sources, there are 254 documents or about 37% of the social science research field that examines ethnic entrepreneurship, and makes Nijkamp the author with the most publications with a total of 10 articles. The United States is the country with the most research on ethnic entrepreneurship.

Ethnic Entrepreneurship with a total of 118 articles. Then the research conducted by Chaganti, Radha & Greene, Patricia G. (2002) became the most frequently cited article with a total of 217 citations.

Based on the results of bibliometric co-occurrence analysis using VOSviewer software, the trends of ethnic entrepreneurship research topics are grouped into 7 clusters with 122 items. Topics included in cluster 1 (25 items) are entrepreneur, ethnic enclaves, ethnic entrepreneurship, ethnicity, firm ownership, gender, gender role, minority group, minority, etc. Cluster 2 (21 items) consists of consumption behavior, culture, economics, ethnic businesses, ethnic entrepreneurs, ethnic identity, ethnic minorities, identity, innovation, etc. Cluster 3 (19 items) consists of African immigrant, business, economic development, ethnic business, ethnic enterprise, ethnic group, family business, integration, migrants etc. Cluster 4 (18 items) consists of Asian immigrant, employment, entrepreneurial, ethnic economy, ethnic enclave, immigrant entrepreneurship, immigrant population etc. Cluster 5 (15 items) consists of business development, business performance, conceptual framework, diaspora, ethnic entrepreneur, industrial performance, multinational enterprise, networks, transnational entrepreneurship etc. Cluster 6 (15 items) consists of cultural identity, eastern hemisphere, economic activity, historical perspective, social network, southeast asia, transnationalism etc. Cluster 7 (9 items) consists of entrepreneurial orientation, entrepreneurialism, entrepreneurs, ethnic group, ethnography, turkey, Germany etc. Some contemporary topics published since 2016, which are colored yellow such as ethnic enclave, immigrant entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial orientation, international migrants, social capital, ethnography, family business. Based on the results of density visualization mapping, research topics that are still little discussed are those including multinational enterprises, migrant workers, ethnic economy, migrant experience, multiculturalism, ethnic minorities, entrepreneurial orientation ethnic business, business performance and historical perspective.

REFERENCES

A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.so.16.080190.000551


6) CHAGANTI, R. & GREENE Patricia G. (2002), Who are ethnic entrepreneurs.


A Bibliometric Study in Two Decades of Ethnic Entrepreneurship


